

Champions of Outstanding Choices in Public Education for All Children

Compilation of Laws Regarding Charter Revocation and Revocation Appeals

(Cal. Ed. Code Section 47607(c)-(k); Cal. Code Reg., tit. 5, Sections 11965, 11968.5.5)

March 1, 2019

[Please note the information contained here is current as to the date listed above. In addition, because law is constantly changing, we do not recommend that you act on this information without consulting legal counsel.]



TABLE OF CONTENTS

Charter Revocation and Revocation Appeals

California Education Code

Section 47607(c)-(k).	Term of charter; renewals and material revisions of charter; considerations and criteria; revocation; appeal procedure
Section 47607.3.	Failure to improve pupil outcomes; technical assistance to charter schools; revocation of charter following findings of the California Collaborative for Educational Excellence
California Code of Regulations, Title 5	
Section 11965.	Definitions
Section 11968.5.1.	Revocation of, or Other Action Related to, a Charter by the State Board of Education upon Recommendation by the State Superintendent of Public Instruction Pursuant to Education Code Sections 47604.5(a) and (b)
Section 11968.5.2.	Charter Revocation6
Section 11968.5.3.	Charter Revocation When There is a Severe and Imminent Threat to the Health or Safety of Pupils and Appeal of Revocation by Determination of a Severe and Imminent Threat to Pupil Health or Safety to a County Board of Education and the State Board of Education
Section 11968.5.4.	Appeal of a District Charter Revocation to a County Board of Education 10
Section 11968.5.5.	Appeal of Charter Revocation to the State Board of Education and Submission of the Administrative Record11



LAW OFFICES OF YOUNG, MINNEY & CORR, LLP

SACRAMENTO - LOS ANGELES - SAN DIEGO

CHARTER REVOCATION AND REVOCATION APPEALS

(CALIFORNIA EDUCATION CODE)

§ 47607. Term of charter; renewals and material revisions of charter; considerations and criteria; revocation; appeal procedure

- **(c)(1)** A charter may be revoked by the authority that granted the charter under this chapter if the authority finds, through a showing of substantial evidence, that the charter school did any of the following:
 - **(A)** Committed a material violation of any of the conditions, standards, or procedures set forth in the charter.
 - **(B)** Failed to meet or pursue any of the pupil outcomes identified in the charter.
 - **(C)** Failed to meet generally accepted accounting principles, or engaged in fiscal mismanagement.
 - **(D)** Violated any provision of law.
 - (2) The authority that granted the charter shall consider increases in pupil academic achievement for all groups of pupils served by the charter school as the most important factor in determining whether to revoke a charter.
- (d) Before revocation, the authority that granted the charter shall notify the charter school of any violation of this section and give the school a reasonable opportunity to remedy the violation, unless the authority determines, in writing, that the violation constitutes a severe and imminent threat to the health or safety of the pupils.
- (e) Before revoking a charter for failure to remedy a violation pursuant to subdivision (d), and after expiration of the school's reasonable opportunity to remedy without successfully remedying the violation, the chartering authority shall provide a written notice of intent to revoke and notice of facts in support of revocation to the charter school. No later than 30 days after providing the notice of intent to revoke a charter, the chartering authority shall hold a public hearing, in the normal course of business, on the issue of whether evidence exists to revoke the charter. No later than 30 days after the public hearing, the chartering authority shall issue a final decision to revoke or decline to revoke the charter, unless the chartering authority and the charter school agree to extend the issuance of the decision by an additional 30 days. The chartering authority shall not revoke a charter, unless it makes written factual findings supported by substantial evidence, specific to the charter school, that support its findings.
- **(f)(1)** If a school district is the chartering authority and it revokes a charter pursuant to this section, the charter school may appeal the revocation to the county board of education within 30 days following the final decision of the chartering authority.
 - (2) The county board of education may reverse the revocation decision if the county board of education determines that the findings made by the chartering authority under subdivision (e) are not supported by substantial evidence. The school district may appeal the reversal to the state board.
 - (3) If the county board of education does not issue a decision on the appeal within 90 days of receipt, or the county board of education upholds the revocation, the charter school may appeal the revocation to the state board.



- **(4)** The state board may reverse the revocation decision if the state board determines that the findings made by the chartering authority under subdivision (e) are not supported by substantial evidence. The state board may uphold the revocation decision of the school district if the state board determines that the findings made by the chartering authority under subdivision (e) are supported by substantial evidence.
- **(g)(1)** If a county office of education is the chartering authority and the county board of education revokes a charter pursuant to this section, the charter school may appeal the revocation to the state board within 30 days following the decision of the chartering authority.
 - **(2)** The state board may reverse the revocation decision if the state board determines that the findings made by the chartering authority under subdivision (e) are not supported by substantial evidence.
- **(h)** If the revocation decision of the chartering authority is reversed on appeal, the agency that granted the charter shall continue to be regarded as the chartering authority.
- (i) During the pendency of an appeal filed under this section, a charter school, whose revocation proceedings are based on subparagraph (A) or (B) of paragraph (1) of subdivision (c), shall continue to qualify as a charter school for funding and for all other purposes of this part, and may continue to hold all existing grants, resources, and facilities, in order to ensure that the education of pupils enrolled in the school is not disrupted.
- (j) Immediately following the decision of a county board of education to reverse a decision of a school district to revoke a charter, the following shall apply:
 - (1) The charter school shall qualify as a charter school for funding and for all other purposes of this part.
 - (2) The charter school may continue to hold all existing grants, resources, and facilities.
 - (3) Any funding, grants, resources, and facilities that had been withheld from the charter school, or that the charter school had otherwise been deprived of use, as a result of the revocation of the charter shall be immediately reinstated or returned.
- **(k)** A final decision of a revocation or appeal of a revocation pursuant to subdivision (c) shall be reported to the chartering authority, the county board of education, and the department.
- § 47607.3. Failure to improve pupil outcomes; technical assistance to charter schools; revocation of charter following findings of the California Collaborative for Educational Excellence
- (a) If a charter school fails to improve outcomes for three or more pupil subgroups identified pursuant to Section 52052, or, if the charter school has less than three pupil subgroups, all of the charter school's pupil subgroups, in regard to one or more state or school priority identified in the charter pursuant to subparagraph (A) of paragraph (5) of subdivision (b) of Section 47605 or subparagraph (A) of paragraph (5) of subdivision (b) of Section 47605.6, in three out of four consecutive school years, all of the following shall apply:
 - (1) Using an evaluation rubric adopted by the state board pursuant to Section 52064.5, the chartering authority shall provide technical assistance to the charter school.



- **(2)** At the request of the chartering authority the California Collaborative for Educational Excellence may, after consulting with the Superintendent, and with the approval of the state board, provide advice and assistance to the charter school pursuant to Section 52074.
- **(b)** A chartering authority shall consider for revocation any charter school to which the California Collaborative for Educational Excellence has provided advice and assistance pursuant to subdivision (a) and about which it has made either of the following findings, which shall be submitted to the chartering authority:
 - (1) That the charter school has failed, or is unable, to implement the recommendations of the California Collaborative for Educational Excellence.
 - (2) That the inadequate performance of the charter school, based upon an evaluation rubric adopted pursuant to Section 52064.5, is either so persistent or so acute as to require revocation of the charter.
- **(c)** The chartering authority shall consider increases in pupil academic achievement for all pupil subgroups served by the charter school as the most important factor in determining whether to revoke the charter.
- (d) A chartering authority shall comply with the hearing process described in subdivision (e) of Section 47607 in revoking a charter. A charter school may not appeal a revocation of a charter made pursuant to this section.

(CALIFORNIA CODE OF REGULATIONS, TITLE 5)

§ 11965. Definitions

For the purposes of Articles 1, 2 and 2.5, the following definitions shall apply:

- (a) "Chartering authority" means the entity that grants a school's charter and includes the following:
 - (1) "County chartering authority" means a county board of education that has granted a school's charter. In making specific the provisions of Education Code section 47607(g)(1), these regulations use the term "county chartering authority" where Education Code section 47607(g)(1) uses the term "county office of education."
 - (2) "District chartering authority" means the governing board of a school district that has granted a school's charter. In making specific the provisions of Education Code section 47607(f)(1), these regulations use the term "district chartering authority" where Education Code section 47607(f)(1) uses the term "school district."
 - (3) "State chartering authority" is the State Board of Education (SBE) when the SBE has granted a school's charter. The SBE acts as a state chartering authority when it approves the operation of a charter school that has been denied by a local educational agency (LEA) and when it approves the operation of a state charter school pursuant to Education Code section 47605.8.
- **(b)** "Final Decision" means the final written decision of the chartering authority to either revoke or decline to revoke a school's charter.
- **(c)** "Notice of Appeal" means a written document notifying the county board of education or the SBE, as appropriate, that the charter school's governing body as described in the school's charter, or the district chartering authority is appealing the decision to revoke or reverse the revocation of a school's charter.



- (d) "Notice of Intent to Revoke" means the written notice of a chartering authority's decision to pursue revocation of a school's charter due to the charter school's failure to remedy one or more violations identified in the Notice(s) of Violation. This notice shall identify all of the following:
 - (1) All evidence relied upon by the chartering authority in determining that the charter school failed to remedy a violation pursuant to this section;
 - (2) The date and time at which the chartering authority will hold a public hearing concerning revocation, which shall be held no more than 30 calendar days after the chartering authority issues this notice.
- **(e)** "Notice of Revocation by Determination of a Severe and Imminent Threat to Pupil Health or Safety" means the written notice of a chartering authority's decision to revoke a school's charter due to a severe and imminent threat to the health or safety of the pupils. This notice shall identify all of the following:
 - The location of the facility;
 - (2) The provisions of Education Code section 47607(c) that the charter school has violated and a description of the emergency or urgent conditions that have resulted from this violation;
 - **(3)** A description of how the condition(s) identified in subdivision (2) severely and imminently threatens the health or safety of pupils.
 - (4) For purposes of this article, "a severe and imminent threat to pupil health or safety" occurs when a charter school's structures, systems or practices are in a condition that poses a severe and imminent threat to the health or safety of pupils while at school, and where the charter school has made no reasonable attempt to remedy the condition or no remedy exists to cure the condition.
 - (5) For purposes of this article, "a severe and imminent threat to pupil health or safety" does not include any cosmetic or nonessential repairs or severe threats for which the school has initiated corrective action and has removed the pupils from any immediate danger.
- **(f)** "Notice of Violation" means the written notice of a chartering authority's identification of one or more specific alleged violations by the charter school based on the grounds for revocation specified in Education Code section 47607(c). This notice shall identify all of the following:
 - (1) The charter school's alleged specific material violation of a condition, standard, or procedure set out in the school's charter pursuant to Education Code section 47607(c)(1); the specific pupil outcome(s) identified in the school's charter that the charter school allegedly failed to meet or pursue pursuant to Education Code section 47607(c)(2); the charter school's alleged fiscal mismanagement or specific failure to follow generally accepted accounting principles pursuant to Education Code section 47607(c)(3); or the specific provision(s) of law that the charter school allegedly failed to follow pursuant to Education Code section 47607(c)(4), as appropriate.
 - (2) All evidence relied upon by the chartering authority in determining the charter school engaged in any of the acts or omissions identified in subdivision (f)(1) including the date and duration of the alleged violation(s), showing the violation(s) is/are both material and uncured, and that the alleged violation(s) occurred within a reasonable period of time before a notice of violation is issued; and



- (3) The period of time that the chartering authority has concluded is a reasonable period of time for the charter school to remedy or refute the identified violation(s). In identifying the time period that will serve as the charter school's reasonable opportunity to remedy the identified violation(s), the chartering authority shall consider the amount of time reasonably necessary to remedy each identified violation, which may include the charter school's estimation as to the anticipated remediation time.
- **(g)** "Private school" as that term is used in Education Code section 47602(b) means a school that meets the requirements set forth in Education Code sections 48222 and 48223.
- (h) For each charter school, "satisfactory progress," as that term is used in Education Code section 47612, means uninterrupted progress (1) towards completion, with passing grades, of the substance of the course of study that is required for graduation from a non-charter comprehensive high school of the school district that authorized the charter school's charter, that the pupil has not yet completed, (2) at a rate that is at least adequate to allow the pupil to successfully complete, through full-time attendance, all of that uncompleted coursework within the aggregate amount of time assigned by the chartering agency for the study of that particular quantity of coursework within its standard academic schedule. If the chartering authority is not a school district having at least one non-charter comprehensive high school, the applicable high school graduation requirements and associated time assignments shall be those for the comprehensive high school(s) of the largest unified school district, as measured by average daily attendance, in the county or counties in which the charter school operates.

For individuals with exceptional needs, as defined in Education Code section 56026, "satisfactory progress," as that term is used in Education Code section 47612, means uninterrupted maintenance of progress towards meeting the goals and benchmarks or short-term objectives specified in his or her individualized education program made pursuant to 20 U.S.C. Section 1414(d) until high school graduation requirements have been met, or until the pupil reaches an age at which special education services are no longer required by law.

- (i) "School's charter" is the document approved by the chartering authority, including any material revisions that have been approved by the chartering authority.
- (j) "Statewide benefit charter" is a charter school authorized by the SBE to operate at multiple sites throughout the state pursuant to Education Code section 47605.8. In making specific the provisions of Education Code section 47605.8, these regulations use the term "statewide benefit charter" where Education Code section 47605.8 uses the term "state charter school."
- (a) Prior to making a recommendation to the SBE under Education Code sections 47604.5(a) and (b), the SSPI shall deliver a written notice to the charter school's governing body as described in the school's charter and the SBE Executive Director, which identifies one or more specific alleged violations by the charter school based on the grounds specified in Education Code sections 47604.5(a) and (b). This notice shall identify all of the following:
 - (1) the charter school's alleged gross financial mismanagement that jeopardizes the financial stability of the charter school pursuant to Education Code section 47604.5(a); or the charter school's alleged illegal or substantially improper use of charter school funds for the personal benefit of any officer, director, or fiduciary of the charter school pursuant to Education Code section 47604.5(b);
 - (2) all evidence relied upon by the SSPI in determining the charter school engaged in any of the acts or omissions identified in subdivision (a)(1); and

§ 11968.5.1. Revocation of, or Other Action Related to, a Charter by the State Board of Education upon Recommendation by the State Superintendent of Public Instruction Pursuant to Education Code Sections 47604.5(a) and (b)



- (3) the period of time that will serve as the opportunity to remedy or refute the identified violation(s) by the charter school's governing body as described in the school's charter.
- **(b)** Upon receipt of a written notice, the charter school's governing body as described in the school's charter, if it chooses to respond, shall take the following actions:
 - (1) Submit to the SSPI a detailed, written response to each identified violation which shall include the refutation or remedial action taken by the charter school's governing body as described in the school's charter, specific to each identified violation. The written response shall be due by the end of the remedy period identified in the written notice.
 - **(2)** Attach to its written response, supporting evidence of remedial action, if any, including written reports, statements, and other appropriate documentation.
- **(c)** After conclusion of the remedy period, the SSPI shall evaluate the response of the charter school's governing body as described in the school's charter, if submitted, and shall take one of the following actions:
 - (1) Make a recommendation to the SBE to take appropriate action, including but not limited to, revocation of the school's charter, and provide timely written notice of such action within 30 calendar days to the charter school's governing body as described in the school's charter; or
 - (2) Discontinue action and provide written notice of such action to the charter school's governing body as described in the school's charter within 10 calendar days.
- (d) In making a recommendation to the SBE to take appropriate action, including but not limited to, revocation of the school's charter, the SSPI shall present written findings to the SBE at the next regularly scheduled board meeting.

This section sequentially sets forth procedures the chartering authority and the charter school's governing body as described in the school's charter shall complete for the revocation of a school's charter pursuant to Education Code section 47607, except for charter revocation when the violation constitutes a severe and imminent threat to the health or safety of pupils which is subject to section 11968.5.3 rather than this section.

- (a) At least 72 hours prior to any board meeting in which a chartering authority will consider issuing a Notice of Violation, the chartering authority shall provide the charter school with notice and all relevant documents related to the proposed action.
- **(b)** The chartering authority shall deliver a Notice of Violation to the charter school's governing body as described in the school's charter.
- **(c)** Upon receipt of a Notice of Violation, the charter school's governing body as described in the school's charter, if it chooses to respond, shall take the following actions:
 - (1) Submit to the chartering authority a detailed, written response addressing each identified violation which shall include the refutation, remedial action taken, or proposed remedial action by the charter school specific to each alleged violation. The written response shall be due by the end of the remedy period identified in the Notice of Violation.

§ 11968.5.2. Charter Revocation



©2019 LAW OFFICES OF YOUNG, MINNEY & CORR, LLP.

- **(2)** Attach to its written response supporting evidence of the refutation, remedial action, or proposed remedial action, if any, including written reports, statements, and other appropriate documentation.
- (d) After conclusion of the reasonable opportunity to remedy, the chartering authority shall evaluate the response of the charter school's governing body as described in the school's charter response to the Notice of Violation and any supporting evidence, if submitted, and shall take one of the following actions:
 - (1) If the chartering authority has substantial evidence that the charter school has failed to refute to the chartering authority's satisfaction, or remedy a violation identified in the Notice of Violation, continue revocation of the school's charter by issuing a Notice of Intent to Revoke to the charter school's governing body as described in the school's charter; or
 - (2) Discontinue revocation of the school's charter and provide timely written notice of such action to the charter school's governing body as described in the school's charter.
- **(e)** If the chartering authority does not act, as specified in subdivision (d), within 60 calendar days of the conclusion of the remedy period specified in the Notice of Violation, the revocation process is terminated and the Notice of Violation is void.
- **(f)** On the date and time specified in the Notice of Intent to Revoke, the chartering authority shall hold a public hearing concerning revocation. No more than 30 calendar days after the public hearing (or 60 calendar days by written mutual agreement with the charter school) the chartering authority shall issue a Final Decision.
- **(g)** The chartering authority shall provide a copy of the Final Decision to the CDE and its county board of education (unless the county board of education is also the chartering authority), within 10 calendar days of issuing the Final Decision.
- **(h)** If the chartering authority does not act to issue a Final Decision within the timeframe specified in subdivision (f), the revocation process is terminated and the Notice of Intent to Revoke is void.

This section sets forth procedures the chartering authority shall complete for the revocation of a school's charter when the chartering authority has determined that any violation under Education Code section 47607(c) constitutes a severe and imminent threat to the health or safety of pupils and the procedures that a charter school and county office of education and SBE must follow if the charter school elects to appeal a chartering authority's Final Decision to revoke the school's charter.

- (a) If there is a severe and imminent threat to pupil health or safety, the chartering authority is exempt from the requirements of section 11968.5.2 and may immediately revoke the school's charter by approving and delivering a Notice of Revocation by Determination of a Severe and Imminent Threat to Pupil Health or Safety to the charter school's governing body as described in the school's charter, the county board of education (unless the county board of education is also the chartering authority), and the CDE.
- **(b)** Following the approval and delivery of the Notice of Revocation by Determination of a Severe and Imminent Threat to Pupil Health or Safety by the chartering authority, the charter school's governing body as described in the school's charter may appeal to the county board of education or the SBE, as applicable, pursuant to Education Code sections 47607(f) and (g).

§ 11968.5.3. Charter
Revocation When There is a
Severe and Imminent Threat to
the Health or Safety of Pupils
and Appeal of Revocation by
Determination of a Severe and
Imminent Threat to Pupil
Health or Safety to a County
Board of Education and the
State Board of Education



- **(c)** In an appeal to a county board of education, within 30 calendar days of receipt of a Final Decision revoking the school's charter, the charter school's governing body as described in the school's charter shall approve and deliver a written Notice of Appeal to the county board of education that:
 - (1) includes a copy of the Notice of Revocation by Determination of a Severe and Imminent Threat to Pupil Health or Safety issued pursuant to this article except that the charter school shall not be responsible for providing this document if the chartering authority did not provide it to the charter school as required in this section:
 - (2) includes evidence of the final vote of the chartering authority, if available;
 - (3) includes all evidence relied upon by the chartering authority in determining that a violation under section 11965(e) existed;
 - (4) includes minutes of any public meeting at which the chartering authority considers or makes its decision to revoke the school's charter, if available; and
 - (5) includes a written statement explaining why the charter school does not believe the district chartering authority's factual findings are supported by substantial evidence.
- (d) If the county board of education does not issue a written decision that explains whether, in the county board of education's judgment, the district chartering authority's factual findings are supported by substantial evidence within 90 calendar days of receiving a Notice of Appeal that includes the documents listed in subdivision (c) of this section, the district chartering authority's decision is upheld, pending any further appeal.
- **(e)** In determining whether the district chartering authority's factual findings are supported by substantial evidence, the county board of education shall consider whether the district chartering authority provided the charter school's governing body as described in the school's charter a Notice of Revocation by Determination of a Severe and Imminent Threat to Pupil Health or Safety pursuant to Education Code sections 47607(c) and (d).
- **(f)** The county board of education shall provide the CDE and the chartering authority a copy of its written decision within 10 calendar days of its action.
- (g) If the district chartering authority or the school's governing body as described in the school's charter elects to appeal to the SBE, the appellant shall approve and deliver a written Notice of Appeal to the SBE within 30 calendar days following the final decision by the county board of education, or within 30 calendar days upon the expiration of 90 calendar days pursuant to subdivision (d) of this section, or within 30 calendar days of a county chartering authority's Final Decision.
- **(h)** The appellant shall, at the same time it delivers a Notice of Appeal to the SBE, deliver to the SBE the following documents that shall be individually and sequentially numbered, one number per page, and be delivered to the respondent and the county board of education, if applicable, within five calendar days of delivery to the SBE:
 - (1) copies of the Notice of Revocation by Determination of a Severe and Imminent Threat to Pupil Health or Safety, the Final Decision, and the Notice of Appeal delivered to the county board of education, and the county board of education's written decision, as applicable;
 - (2) evidence of the final vote of the chartering authority, if available;



©2019 LAW OFFICES OF YOUNG, MINNEY & CORR, LLP.

- (3) evidence relied upon by the chartering authority in determining that a violation under section 11965(e) existed; and
- (4) minutes of any public meeting at which the chartering authority considers or makes its decision to revoke the school's charter, if available.
- (i) At the same time the appellant submits its Notice of Appeal to the SBE, the appellant shall also submit to the SBE a written argument in the form of a brief or letter that shall be individually and sequentially numbered, one number per page; be delivered to the respondent within five calendar days of delivery to the SBE; and contain the following:
 - (1) a summary of the procedural and substantive facts limited to matters in the record;
 - (2) a summary of the arguments in support of the appellant's position that the chartering authority and/or the county board of education erred in its decision; and
 - (3) specific citations to the administrative record in support of each argument presented.
- (j) If the respondent chooses to submit a written opposition to the SBE, it must do so within 30 calendar days of the delivery of the appellant's written argument to the SBE. This written opposition shall be in the form of a brief or letter that shall be individually and sequentially numbered, one number per page; be delivered to the appellant within five calendar days of delivery to the SBE; and contain the following:
 - (1) a summary of the procedural and substantive facts limited to matters in the record as submitted to the chartering authority and the county board of education, as appropriate;
 - (2) a summary of the arguments in support of the respondent's position that the chartering authority and/or the county board of education did not err in its decision; and
 - (3) specific citations to the administrative record in support of each argument presented.
- **(k)** Within 15 calendar days of the delivery of the respondent's written opposition to the SBE, the appellant may submit to the SBE a written reply to the respondent's written opposition in the form of a brief or letter. If submitted, this written reply shall be individually and sequentially numbered, one number per page; be delivered to the respondent within five calendar days of delivery to the SBE; and contain the following:
 - (1) a summary of the arguments refuting the arguments raised in the respondent's opposition; and
 - (2) specific citations to the administrative record in support of each argument presented.
- (I) If the SBE does not take action within 120 calendar days of receipt of the appellant's written argument, if submitted pursuant to subdivision (i); or within 150 days of receipt of the respondent's written opposition, if submitted pursuant to subdivision (j); or within 165 days of receipt of the appellant's written reply, if submitted pursuant to subdivision (k); whichever is later, the appellant is deemed to have exhausted its administrative remedies.



§ 11968.5.4. Appeal of a **District Charter Revocation to** a County Board of Education

This section establishes the procedures that a charter school and county office of education must follow if the charter school elects to appeal to a county board of education a district chartering authority's Final Decision to revoke the school's

- (a) Within 30 calendar days of receipt of a Final Decision revoking the school's charter, the charter school's governing body as described in the school's charter, shall approve and deliver a written Notice of Appeal to the county board of education that:
 - (1) Includes a copy of the Notice of Violation, Notice of Intent to Revoke and the Final Decision issued pursuant to this article except that the charter school shall not be responsible for providing these documents if the chartering authority did not provide them to the charter school as required in section 11968.5.2;
 - (2) Includes evidence of the final vote of the chartering authority, if available;
 - (3) Includes all evidence relied upon by the chartering authority in determining whether substantial evidence existed that the charter school failed to remedy one or more violations identified in the Notice(s) of Violation;
 - (4) Includes all evidence and correspondence submitted by the charter school's governing body as described in the school's charter in response to the chartering authority's Notice of Violation and Notice of Intent to Revoke;
 - (5) Includes minutes of any public meeting at which the chartering authority considers or makes its decision to revoke the school's charter, if available;
 - (6) Includes a written statement explaining why the charter school does not believe the district chartering authority's factual findings are supported by substantial evidence: and
 - (7) Identifies any procedural omissions or errors the charter school alleges to have occurred in the revocation process.
- (b) If the county board of education does not issue a written decision that explains whether, in the county board of education's judgment, the district chartering authority's factual findings are supported by substantial evidence within 90 calendar days of receiving a Notice of Appeal that includes the documents listed in subdivision (a) of this section, the district chartering authority's decision is upheld, pending any further appeal.
 - (1) In determining whether the district chartering authority's factual findings are supported by substantial evidence, the county board of education shall consider whether the district chartering authority provided the charter school's governing body as described in the school's charter a Notice of Violation, a reasonable opportunity to remedy the identified violation(s), a Notice of Intent to Revoke, a public hearing, and Final Decision, pursuant to Articles 2 and 2.5 and Education Code sections 47607(c) through (e), inclusive.
 - (2) If the charter school submits a response to the Notice of Violation pursuant to section 11968.5.2(c), the county board of education shall, in determining whether the district chartering authority's factual findings are supported by substantial evidence, consider whether the charter school complied with the procedures set forth in that section.



- (3) The county board of education shall also consider whether an alleged procedural deficiency negatively impacted the charter school's ability to refute or remedy the alleged violation or the chartering authority's ability to comply with its procedural obligations or authorizing duties.
- **(c)** The county board of education shall provide the CDE and the chartering authority a copy of its written decision within 10 calendar days of its action.
- (d) An appeal to a county board of education of a Notice of Revocation by Determination of a Severe and Imminent Threat to Pupil Health or Safety is subject to section 11968.5.3 rather than this section.

§ 11968.5.5. Appeal of Charter Revocation to the State Board of Education and Submission of the Administrative Record

- (a) If the district chartering authority or the charter school's governing body as described in the school's charter elects to appeal to the SBE, the appellant shall approve and deliver a written Notice of Appeal to the SBE within 30 calendar days of receiving a written decision by the county board of education, within 30 calendar days upon the expiration of 90 calendar days pursuant to section 11968.5.4(b), or within 30 calendar days of a county chartering authority's Final Decision.
- **(b)** The appellant shall, at the same time it delivers a Notice of Appeal to the SBE, deliver to the SBE the following documents that shall be individually and sequentially numbered, one number per page, and be delivered to the respondent and the county board of education, if applicable, within five calendar days of delivery to the SBE:
 - (1) copies of the Notice of Violation, Notice of Intent to Revoke, the Final Decision, the Notice of Appeal to the county board of education, and the county board of education's written decision, as applicable;
 - (2) evidence of the final vote of the chartering authority if available;
 - (3) evidence relied upon by the chartering authority in determining whether substantial evidence existed that the charter school failed to refute to the chartering authority's satisfaction or remedy one or more violations identified in the Notice(s) of Violation;
 - (4) evidence and correspondence submitted by the charter school's governing body as described in the school's charter in response to the chartering authority's Notice of Violation and Notice of Intent to Revoke; and
 - (5) minutes of any public meeting at which the chartering authority considers or makes its decision to revoke the school's charter if available.
- **(c)** At the same time the appellant submits its Notice of Appeal to the SBE, the appellant shall also submit to the SBE a written argument in the form of a brief or letter that shall be individually and sequentially numbered, one number per page; be delivered to the respondent within five calendar days of delivery to the SBE; and contain the following:
 - (1) a summary of the procedural and substantive facts limited to matters in the record:
 - (2) a summary of the arguments in support of the appellant's position that the chartering authority and/or the county board of education erred in its decision; and
 - (3) specific citations to the administrative record in support of each argument presented.



- (d) If the respondent chooses to submit a written opposition to the SBE, it must do so within 30 calendar days of the delivery of the appellant's written argument to the SBE. This written opposition shall be in the form of a brief or letter that shall be individually and sequentially numbered, one number per page; be delivered to the appellant within five calendar days of delivery to the SBE; and contain the following:
 - (1) a summary of the procedural and substantive facts limited to matters in the record as submitted to the chartering authority and the county board of education, as appropriate;
 - (2) a summary of the arguments in support of the respondent's position that the chartering authority and/or the county board of education did not err in its decision;
 - (3) specific citations to the administrative record in support of each argument presented.
- (e) Within 15 calendar days of the delivery of the respondent's written opposition to the SBE, the appellant may submit to the SBE a written reply to the respondent's written opposition in the form of a brief or letter. If submitted, this written reply shall be individually and sequentially numbered, one number per page; be delivered to the respondent within five calendar days of delivery to the SBE; and contain the following:
 - (1) a summary of the arguments refuting the arguments raised in respondent's opposition; and
 - (2) specific citations to the administrative record in support of each argument presented;
- (f) If the SBE does not take action within 120 calendar days of receipt of the appellant's written argument, if submitted pursuant to subdivision (c); or within 150 days of receipt of the respondent's written opposition, if submitted pursuant to subdivision (d); or within 165 days of receipt of the appellant's written reply, if submitted pursuant to subdivision (e); whichever is later, the appellant is deemed to have exhausted its administrative remedies.
- (g) An appeal to the SBE of a Notice of Revocation by Determination of a Severe and Imminent Threat to Pupil Health or Safety is subject to section 11968.5.3 rather than this section.

